

Citation database: Bastiaanssen J, Johnson D and Lucas K. (2020) Does transport help people to gain employment? A systematic review and meta-analysis of the empirical evidence. Transport Reviews (Forthcoming).

Study	Journal	Country	Sample	Transport measure	Emp. outcome	Model	Control	IV/S	Effect	Meta
Alam (2009)	TRR	US	W	CAR (HH), GAPT (TAZ)	MW	OLS, PL	I, HH, N	S	+	N
Andersson et al. (2018)	TRES	US	UNEMP	GACARPT (CT)	IUD	TOB, PL	I, HH, N	S	+	N
Aslund et al. (2015)	WP	SW	T/C	PTACCESS	IEP	OLS, PL	I, HH, N	DID /S	+	N
Bania et al. (2003)	JPDR	US	W (F)	LICENSE, CUMACPT/ CAR	IEP, WP	MNL, PL	I, HH, N	IV/S	+/-	N
Bania et al. (2008)	US	US	W (FM)	GATWRCAR (CT)	IEP	BNL, PL	I, HH, N	S	+	Y
Bansak et al. (2010)	IR	US	W (FSM)	CAR (I)	IEP, WWH	2SLS	I, HH, N	IV/S	+	N
Bastiaanssen et al. (2020a)	US	UK	-	GAPT (LSOA)	IEP	PROB, CS	I, HH, N	IV/S	+	N
Bastiaanssen et al. (2020b)	US	NL	NOCAR/ CAR	GAPT/CAR (PC4)	IEP	PROB, CS	I, HH, N	IV/S	+	N
Bastiaanssen et al. (2020c)	RETRE C	NL	NOCAR/ CAR	GAPT/CAR (PC4)	IEP	PROB, CS	I, HH, N	IV/S	+	N
Bauder and Perle (1999)	EP	US	Y (B/W/CIT/ SUB/E/NE /H/NH)	CAR1/2 (HH), MCT	IEP	BNL, CS	I, HH, N	S	+/-	Y
Baum (2009)	JUE	US	W (FSM)	CAR (I)	IEP, WWH	BNL, CS	I, HH, N	IV	+	Y
Bee (2009)	WP	US	LINC	CAR (HH)	IEP	2SLS, PL	I, HH, N	S	+	N
Berechman and Paaswell (2001)	BTS	US	LINC	MCT	LPR	2SLS, CS	N	IV/S	+	N
Blumenberg (2002)	EDQ	US	W (M/W)	PTDEP	IEP	BNL, CS	I, HH, N	S	-	N
Blumenberg (2008)	TP	US	W (W/B/L/A)	CAR (HH)	IEP	BNL, CS	I, HH, N	S	+	Y
Blumenberg and Pierce (2014)	JAPA	US	W (F), LTERM	GCAR (I), CUMACAR (CT)	IEP	MNL, PL	I, HH, N	S	+/-	N
Blumenberg and Pierce (2017)	JPER	US	W (F)	CAR (I), CUMACAR (CT)	IEP	MNL, PL	I, HH, N	S	+	N
Cavaco and Lesueur (2004)	RFE	FR	UNEMP	CARS (I), MCT	IUD	DM, PL	I, HH, N	S	+	N
Cervero and Tsai (2003)	TRR	US	W	CAR (I), GACAR/PT (CT)	IEP	MNL, PL	I, HH	S	+	N
Cervero et al. (2002)	JPER	US	W	GCAR (I), GACAR/PT (CT)	IEP	MNL, PL	I, HH, N	S	+/-	N
Chen et al. (2017)	REP	GH	M/F/EDU	CUMACPTF (CT)	IEP	OLS/B NL, CS	I, HH, N	-	+	N
Cooke (1997)	UG	US	F (W/B)	PTDEP, MCTPT	IEP	MNL, CS	I, HH, N	S	0	N
Danziger et al. (2000)	US	US	W (FSM)	NOCAR (I), NOLICENSE (I)	WWH	BNL, CS	I, HH, N	S	+	N
Dawkins et al. (2005)	JUE	US	UNEMP	CAR (HH), JTMARATIO	IUD	DM, PL	I, HH, N	S	+	N
Détang-Dessendre and Gaigné (2009)	RSUE	FR	UNEMP	GATWRCAR/P T (MUN)	IUD	DM, PL	I, HH, N	S	+	N
Di Paolo (2014)	REP	SP	M/F, LTERM	CARS (HH), GAPT (MUN)	IEP	BPROB , CS	I, HH, N	S	+	N

Duguet et al. (2009)	RE	FR	UNEMP	CUMACAR/PT (MUN)	UMPR	OLS, PL	N	DID /S	+	N
Ellwood (1986)	BOOK	US	Y (W/B)	MCT, PROPCUMAPT (CT)	EMPR	OLS, CS	N	S	+	N
Franklin (2015)	SERC	ET	Y	TRANSUB	IEP	OLS, PL	I, HH, N	DID /S	+	N
Gao et al. (2007)	ARS	US	-	VEHCAP, GACAR (TAZ)	EMPR	SEM, CS	N	-	+/-	N
Garasky et al. (2006)	JCA	US	LINC	CAR (I)	IEP	BPROB, CS	I, HH, N	S	+	N
Gobillon and Selod (2007)	WP	FR	W, PUBH	JTWRATIO (MUN)	IEP	MNL, PL	I, HH, N	S	-	N
Gobillon et al. (2011)	JAE	FR	W	JTWRATIO (MUN)	IUD	OLS, PL	I, HH, N	S	-	N
Gurley and Bruce (2005)	JUE	US	W	CAR (I)	IEP, WP	MNL, PL	I, HH, N	S	+	N
Holloway (1996)	TPG	US	Y (WE/WNE/BE/BNE)	MCTCAR	IEP	BNL, CS	I, HH, N	S	+	Y
Holzer et al. (1994)	JUE	US	Y (W/B)	CAR (I), MCT	IUD	OLS, PL	I, HH, N	S	+	N
Holzer et al. (2003)	JPAM	US	W/B/L	PTACCESS	IEP	MNL-DID, PL	I, HH, N	-	+	N
Hu (2015)	JAPA	US	-	GAPT (CT)	WTTPR	OLS, PL	N	-	0	N
Hu (2016)	TR	US	INCG	CAR (I), GATWRCAR/PT (CT)	IEP	BNL, CS	I, HH, N	IV/S	+	Y
Hu and Giuliano (2014)	JUA	US	LINC	GAPT (CT)	WTTPR	2SLS, PL	I, HH, N	IV/S	+	N
Ihlanfeldt (1992)	REP	US	Y (W/B/E/NE/H/NH)	MCTCAR (CT)	IEP	BNL, CS	I, HH	S		Y
Ihlanfeldt (1993)	JUE	US	Y (W/B/E/NE/H/NH)	MCTCAR (CT)	IEP	BNL, PL	I, HH	S	+	Y
Ihlanfeldt and Sjoquist (1990)	AER	US	Y (W/B/E/NE/H/NH)	MCTCAR (CT)	IEP	BNL, CS	I, HH, N	S	+	Y
Ihlanfeldt and Sjoquist (1991)	US	US	Y (BEH/WEH)	MCTCAR (CT)	IEP	BNL, CS	I, HH, N	S	+	Y
Johnson (2006)	RSUE	US	W/B	CAR (I), CUMADIST	IUD	LOG, CS	I, HH, N	-	+	N
Johnson et al. (2017)	TP	UK	-	MCTPT (CT)	EMPR	2SLS, CS	N	IV	+	N
Kawabata (2002)	RPS	US	W, NOCAR	CAR (I), GAPTRATIO (TAZ)	IEP	MNL, PL	I, HH, N	S	+	N
Kawabata (2003)	EP	US	LS, NOCAR	CAR (I), GAPTRATIO (TAZ)	IEP	MNL, PL	I, HH, N	S	+	N
Korsu and Wenglenski (2010)	US	FR	LEDU, LTERM	CUMAPT/CAR (CT)	IUP	BNL, CS	I, HH, N	S	+	N
Le Gallo et al. (2017)	JUE	FR	Y	VOUDDL	IEP	OLS, PL	I, HH, N	DID /S	+	N
Lin et al. (2014)	RS	TH	ABOR	CAR (I), MCD, GATWRCAR/PT (TAZ)	IEP, IES, IW	BNL, CS	I, HH	-	+	Y
Lucas (2003)	TR	US	W	CAR (I)	EIP	OLS, PL	I, HH, N	S	+	N
Marada and Květoň (2016)	TESG	CZ	-	CAR (I), CARINDEX	EMPR	BNL, CS	N	-	+	Y

Matas et al. (2010)	US	SP	EDU (F), LTERM	CARS (HH), CUMAPT (MUN)	IEP	BPROB , CS	I, HH, N	S	+	N
Norman et al. (2012)	WP	SW	-	GAPT (MUN)	EMPR, LFPR	OLS, CS	N	-	+	N
Norman et al. (2017)	JTEP	SW	-	GAPT (MUN)	EMPR	OLS, CS	N	-	+	N
O'Regan and Quigley (1991)	RSUE	US	Y (W/B)	MCT (CT)	UMPR	LOG, CS	N	S	+	N
O'Regan and Quigley (1996)	NEER	US	Y	MCT (CT)	IEP	BNL, CS	I, N	S	+	Y
O'Regan and Quigley (1998)	US	US	Y	MCT (CT)	IEP	BNL, CS	I, HH, N	IV/S	+/-	Y
O'Connell et al. (2012)	ESR	IR	W (M/F)	CAR (I), PTACCESS	IEP	BPROB , PL	I, HH, N	S	+/-	N
Ong (1996)	SWR	US	W (F)	CAR (I)	IEP, WWH, MW, HW	BNL, CS	I, HH	S	+	Y
Ong (2002)	JPAM	US	W (FS)	CAR (I)	IEP	BNL, CS	I, HH	IV/S	+	Y
Ong and Houston (2002)	UG	US	W (FS)	NOCAR (I), PTACCESS	IEP	BNL, CS	I, HH, N	S	+	N
Ong and Miller (2005)	JPER	US	-	NOVEHCAP, JDEN	EMPR	2SLS, CS	N	IV	+/-	N
Ozbay et al. (2006)	JTE	US	-	MGCT (CT)	LME	2/3SLS	I, HH, N	IV	+	N
Painter et al. (2007)	US	US	Y	CAR (HH), GJG	IEP	PROB, CS	I, HH, N	S	+	N
Parks (2004)	EG	US	EDUL (F, B/MX/VT/ CH/KO/S A/GU)	GACAR (CT)	IUP	BNL, CS	I, HH, N	S	+	N
Perle et al. (2002)	PG	US	Y	CAR1/2 (HH), MCT (CT)	IEP	BNL, CS	I, HH, N	S	+	Y
Phillips (2014)	LE	US	LWU	TRANSUB	IEP	OLS, PL	I, HH, N	DID /S	+	N
Quintanar (2012)	WP	MX	M/F/Y	GATWRCAR/P T (CT)	IEP	PROB, CS	I, HH, N	S	+	Y
Raphael (1998)	JUE	US	Y (W/B)	GATWRCAR (TAZ)	EMPR	OLS, CS	N	S	+	N
Raphael and Rice (2002)	JUE	US	-	CAR (I)	IEP, WWH, HW	2SLS, CS	I, HH, N	IV	+	N
Raphael et al. (2001)	UA	US	W/B/L	CAR (HH)	IEP	2SGLS, PL	I, HH, N	IV	+	N
Rice (2001)	WP	US	EDU	CAR (I), PTDEN	IEP, WWH, HW	BPROB , CS	I, HH, N	S	+	N
Rogers (1997)	JUE	US	W	CUMACAR (ZC)	IUD	BNL, PL	I, HH, N	S	+	Y
Rotger and Nielsen (2015)	EJTIR	DM	-	PTACCESS	EMPR	OLS, PL	N	DID	+	N
Sanchez (1999)	JAPA	US	W/B	VEHCAP, PTFREQ, DISTPT, MCT, GAPT (TAZ)	WW	2SLS, CS	I, HH, N	IV	+/-	N
Sanchez et al. (2004)	US	US	W	CAR (I), PTFREQ, GACAR/PT (TAZ)	IEP, WP	MNL, PL	I, HH, N	S	+	N
Sanchis-Guarner (2013)	SERC	UK	-	MCT, GACAR (CT)	WWH, LOGW	OLS, PL	I, HH, N	-	+	N
Sandoval et al. (2011)	AG	US	W	GACAR (I), GACAR/PT (CT)	IEP	MNL, PL	I, HH	S	+	N

Sari (2015)	TRR	FR	-	PTACCESS	EMPR	OLS, PL	N	DID	+	N
Shen and Sanchez (2005)	HPD	US	W	CAR (I), PTDIST (CT), GATWRPT/CAR,	IEP	BNL, CS	I, HH, N	S	+/-	Y
Smart and Klein, 2015	REP	US	LINC	CARS (HH), CUMAPT (CT)	IUP	REL, PL	I, HH, N	S	+/-	N
Stoll (2005)	US	US	EDUL (W/B/L)	CAR (I), PTDEP	IEP	PROB, CS	I, HH, N	S	+	N
Sullivan (2003)	WP	US	LS	CAR (I)	IEP	BNL, CS	I, HH	S	+	Y
Taylor and Ong (1995)	US	US	LS (W/B/L)	PTDEP, MCT (CT), CCAR/PT	IPE	BNL, CS	I, HH, N	S	+/-	N
Thakuriah (2011)	RS	US	LWW	MCTPT (CT)	IUP, HW	MNL, CS	I, HH, N	S	+	N
Thakuriah and Metaxatos (2000)	TRR	US	W (F)	CAR (I), CUMACAR/PT (CT)	IPE	MNL, PL	I, HH, N	S	+	N
Thompson (1997)	EDQ	US	EDUL (F)	MCTCAR (TAZ)	IEP	PROB, CS	I, HH, N	S	+	N
Thompson (2001)	TRR	US	M/F (W/B/L)	CARS (HH), CUMAPT (TAZ)	IEP	2SLS, CS	I, HH, N	IV	+	N
Tyndall (2017)	US	US	CAR/W/B/ L/A	CAR (I), PTACCESS	IEP	OLS, PL	I, HH, N	DID /S	+/-	N
Tyndall (2019)	WP	US	-	PTACCESS	IEP	2SLS, PL	N	DID /IV	+/-	N
Yi (2006)	TRR	US	NOCAR	CAR (HH), LICENSE, PTDIST, PTACCESS, GAPT (TAZ)	IEP	BNL/ MNL, CS	I, HH, N	S	+	Y

Notes:

We use the following abbreviations:

Journal	AER	American Economic Review
	ARS	The Annals of Regional Science
	BTS	Bureau of Transportation Statistics
	CI	Cities
	CRAM	Centre for Research and Migration
	EDQ	Economic Development Quarterly
	EG	Economic Geography
	EJTIR	European Journal of Transport and Infrastructure Research
	EP	Environment and Planning A
	ESR	Economic and Social Review
	HPD	Housing Policy Debate
	IR	Industrial Relations
	JAE	Journal of Applied Econometrics
	JAPA	Journal of the American Planning Association
	JCA	Journal of Consumer Affairs
	JPAM	Journal of Policy Analysis and Management
	JPDR	Journal of Policy Development and Research
	JPER	Journal of Planning Education and Research
	JTE	Journal of Transportation Engineering
	JTEP	Journal of Transport Economics and Policy
	JUA	Journal of Urban Affairs
	JUE	Journal of Urban Economics

	LE	Labour Economics
	NEER	New England Economic Review
	PG	Professional Geographer
	RE	Revue économique
	REP	Report
	RETREC	Research in Transportation Economics
	RFE	Revue française d'économie
	RPS	Regional Policy Studies
	RS	Regional Science
	RSUE	Regional Science and Urban Economics
	SERC	Spatial Economics Research Centre
	SWR	Science Work Research
	TESG	Tijdschrift voor Economische en Sociale Geografie
	TP	Transport Policy
	TPG	The Professional Geographer
	TR	Transportation
	TRES	The Review of Economics and Statistics
	TRR	Transportation Research Record
	UA	Urban Affairs
	UG	Urban Geography
	US	Urban Studies
	WP	Working paper
Sample:	W	Welfare recipient
	W (F)	Female welfare recipient
	LS	Low-skilled individuals
	M/F	Male or female
	Y	Youth
	Y (B/L/W/A/CIT/SUB)	Youth (Black/ Latin (Hispanic)/ white/ Asian/ central city/ suburbs)
	(E/NE/H/NH)	Enrolled in education/ not enrolled in education/ living at home/ not living at home
	(L/M)INC	Income classes (low or middle)
	ABOR	Aboriginals
	CAR/ NOCAR	Car owning or non-car owning
	LTERM	Long-term residents (e.g. >10 years)
	PUBH	Public housing residents
Transport:	CAR (I)	Car ownership (individual)
	CAR(S) (HH)	Car ownership (household)
	CAR1/2 (HH)	One or multiple cars (household)
	GCAR (I)	Gained car (individual)
	NOCAR (I)	No car ownership (individual)
	(NO)LICENSE	(No) drivers' license
	(NO)VEHCAP	(No) vehicles per capita
	PTACCESS	Public transport access
	PTDIST	Public transport distance
	PTDEN	Public transport route density
	PTFREQ	Public transport frequency
	PTDEP	Public transport dependency
	MCTPT/CAR	Mean commute time public transport/ car
	M(G)CT	Mean (gravity-based) commute time
	GAPTRATIO	Gravity-based public transport to car job accessibility ratio

	CUMACAR/ PT	Cumulative opportunity accessibility car/ public transport
	GACAR/ PT	Gravity-based job accessibility car/ public transport
	GMAC/PT/M	Gravity-based mean job accessibility car/ public transport/ motorcycle
	(M)GATWRCAR/PT	(Mean) Gravity-based job accessibility-to-workers ratio car/ public transport
	PROPCUMAPT	Proportion of jobs reachable by public transport
	TRANSUB	Transport Subsidy
	VOUDL	Voucher for Driving Lessons
	(CT/ TAZ/ MUN/ ZC/ PC4/ LSOA)	Census tract, Transport Analysis Zone, Municipality, Zip Code, Four-digit Postal Code, Lower Super Output Area
Employment outcome:	IEP	Individual employment probability (employed or not employed/ unemployed)
	IFE	Individual probability of non-welfare earnings
	IUP	Individual unemployment probability (not employed/ unemployed or employed)
	LOGW	Log wage (difference)
	IES	Individual employment stability
	IW	Individual wage
	WWH	Weekly worked hours
	HW	Hourly wages
	WW	Weeks worked
	EMPR	Employment rate
	WP	welfare probability
	MW	Months on welfare
	IUD	Individual unemployment duration
	WTPR	Worker-to-population-ratios
	LFPR	Labour force-participation-rate
	WFR	Welfare usage rates
Model:	BNL	Binomial logit regression
	MNL	Multinomial logit regression
	OLS	Ordinary Least Squares regression
	PROB	Probit regression
	TOB	Tobit regression model
	2/3S(G)LS	Two/ Three Stage (Generalized) Least Squares regression
	SEM	Structural Equation Model
	LOG	Log measure
	CS/ PL	Cross Sectional data/ Panel (longitudinal) data or Repeated Cross Sectional
Controls:	I, HH, N	Individual, household, neighbourhoods variables
IV/S:	IV	Instrumental variable approach used
	S	Sample approach used
	DID	Difference-in-Difference
Effect:	+, -, +/-, 0	Positive effect (+), negative effect (-), mixed effects (+/-), non-significant effect (0)
Meta:	Y / N	Included (Y) or excluded (N) from meta-analysis